

**DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
COMMITTEE ON WEIGHTS IX MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, July 22, 2015
Board Conference Room**

Members: Present: Suzanne Mulcahy (Chair), Audra Chang, Paul Daugherty, Jan Iwase, Elton Kinoshita, Roxane Martinez, Glen Miyasato, Cary Miyashiro, Sharlene Morimoto, Fred Murphy, Bruce Naguwa, Gail Nakaahiki, Chad Okamoto, Mitch Otani and Bill Taylor

Staff: Kimberly Chee, Brian Hallett and Gary Zane

Note: These minutes were not approved. COW IX dissolved at the conclusion of this last meeting.

Topic	Who	Discussion
Opening – 9:00 a.m.	Suzanne Mulcahy	Welcomed Committee members. Reviewed the day’s agenda and informed the committee members that the hope is to complete the meeting by 11:00 a.m., as some principals need to return to their schools.
Review and approval of July 13, 2015 meeting minutes	Committee	Members reviewed minutes. Cary Miyashiro moved to approve minutes with amendments. Fred Murphy second. Approved unanimously
Public Testimony		No testimony submitted.
Incentive Programs	Suzanne Mulcahy	Reminded Committee Members of Gilbert Chun’s presentation about utilities and past and current questions about an equitable energy conservation program.
	Fred Murphy	Proposed an incentive program for schools to receive savings for reducing utility cost, but no repercussion for increased utility usage; focus on just the reward side. Schools need to be protected from the whims of the oil market place. Noted that currently, legislators are not allowing DOE to redirect utilities savings to schools instead are reducing appropriation.
	Brian Hallett	Presented about the Executive biennium budget bill HB500 CD1/2015, Section 22. From a budget prospective, predictability for the level of support is a major factor. There are many factors to consider to equitably distribute electricity funds to schools including adequacy, sustainability, environmental factors, market factor, school site factors, and community use.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Inquired if the Department requested additional funds from the legislature when electricity price were going up.
	Bill Taylor	Recalls the Department did the last time oil was above \$100/barrel.
	Fred Murphy	Expressed Mililani High budget cannot absorb an increase in oil.
	Mitch Otani	Stated that everyone’s funds are razor thin already. The state office has shielded schools from an increase in electricity cost in the past.

	Fred Murphy	Electricity might not be able to be distributed equitable within WSF formula, but might be able to outside of WSF. Schools should be given the opportunity to benefit from some sort of electricity incentive program.
	Jan Iwase	Inquired how Hale Kula Elementary, which will have a new air conditioned building this year, would be effected under Mr. Murphy's proposed electricity incentive program.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Recap Fred Murphy's proposal to incentivize utility program. School would receive 50% of electricity saving based on previous year usage. That is if the legislature allows the DOE to keep any electricity savings.
	Fred Murphy	If a new facilities goes operational, electricity usage would probably go up. Schools baseline would reset and the following year they could possibly receive an incentive award.
	Brian Hallett	This could allow schools to "game" the system. Schools can plan to have very good year followed by a very bad year to receive a large electricity incentive saving every other year.
	Mitch Otani	4 years ago, Kalani had an electricity audit conducted by UH and Kalani students, so there is very little opportunity for Kalani to save on electricity.
	Gail Nakaahiki	The proviso seems to require the COW to come up with a proposal. She suggests that the funds for the incentive program come from the Legislatures, not from within the Department.
	Paul Daugherty	Feels that if utilities cost for a school goes up, a school should be penalized. High school has field lights; will there be an increase in base formula for high schools? A large high school would receive more funds if electricity funds were put into WSF, but a small high school loses in this case.
	Chad Okamoto	Suggested that the utilities recommendation to the BOE could be worded stronger. Distributing electricity though WSF would be very inequitable.
	Cary Miyashiro	Electricity cannot be distributed equitably through WSF, but possibly some other method such as grade level.
	Mitch Otani	Recommends distribution of electricity funds be done through categorical funds, not WSF.
	Fred Murphy	Hopes the committee puts forth a proposal that shields schools from paying for increase in electricity usage. The entrepreneurial spirit will spur schools to save. The savings will be allocated after the fact. 50% of saving will go to school, and 50% stays with the state.

	Gail Nakaahiki	Suggested that the Committee edit the recommendation for utilities. The Committee could propose a pilot project for an incentive program for schools wanting to participate. Asked, are we going to chase teacher off campus after school to save electricity?
	Fred Murphy	Motion to respond in writing to the Senate that proposes a year to year saving incentive with half of the saving going to schools and the other half staying with the DOE. Sharlene Morimoto second.
	Roxane Martinez	Express concern if one school saves on electricity and 20 schools didn't, where would the state gets the funds to cover the shortfall. Savings should only be given out when the entire program saves money.
	Jan Iwase	Feels that Committee is not addressing this proviso. The Legislature is expecting a report but we are not able to provide one.
	Paul Daugherty	Legislature won't fund electricity incentive program in perpetuity. To keep all of electricity funds, it needs to go into the weights.
		Motion failed. Yea – Audra Chang, Elton Kinoshita, Glen Miyamoto, Sharlene Morimoto, Fred Murphy, Bruce Naguwa, Nay – Paul Daugherty, Jan Iwase, Roxane Martinez, Cary Miyashiro, Chad Okamoto, Mitch Otani, Gail Nakaahiki, Bill Taylor,
	Bill Daugherty	Motion to recommend the Board to convene a working group to study utilities. Gail Nakaahiki second. Pass unanimously.
Break 10:40 AM – 10:45 AM		
Rural School Funding	Brian Hallett	Reviewed Senate Proviso 48.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	COW #7 and #8, the Committee decided if it wasn't addressed in base funding; schools could apply for WSF reserve funds for any shortfalls.
	Elton Kinoshita	Believes it's not a rural school issue, but more of a school size issue. Small non-rural schools like Waiahole and Kaaawa have the same problems. Hana School is having a tougher time than Lanai because it is smaller. WSF reserve has more than enough funds available to address this issue.
	Mitch Otani	Inquired how many rural schools are Title I schools?
	Kimberly Chee	Reminded committee member that we cannot supplant with Title I funds. Presented alternate scenarios for a bigger base funding for K-8 and K-12 combo schools.
	Elton Kinoshita	Prefers scenario "G" (<i>increase base funding for K-12 combo schools by \$160,000 and K-8 and 6-12 combo schools by \$60,000</i>). Lanai has no curriculum coordinator or academic coaches.

	Glen Miyasato	Agrees with Principal Kinoshita. In his case, it would help provide relief to his teachers by hopefully reducing class loads.
	Bruce Naguwa	Inquired what positions are being added to the base and how much does each position cost.
	Sharlene Morimoto and Gail Nakaahiki	Expressed support for scenario “D” (<i>increase base funding for K-12 combo schools only by \$148,024</i>).
	Cary Miyashiro	Proposed scenario “G” but reduce WSF reserve funds by \$1 million and move it back into WSF to maintain the current dollar for the weight of one.
	Gail Nakaahiki	Motion to accept scenario “D” and reduce WSF reserve fund by the same amount and move it back to WSF to reduce impact to schools. Mitch Otani second. Pass unanimously.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Reiterated COW does not address adequacy, but equity. The previous COW asked for two positions for each school, a teacher (curriculum coordinator) and vice principal. And, Paul Daugherty brought up that the Gifted and Talented (GT) weight is not a true weight.
	Cary Miyashiro	Recalled previous COW was responding to the legislature wanting to see something done to address the GT issue. However, the Department does not have a standard to identify a GT student, so the 3% of a school’s population was considered GT.
	Fred Murphy	Suggested the Committee continue having a weight for GT, but request the state to establish a criteria for classifying a student as GT.
	Bill Taylor	Informed the Committee that program manager Anna Viggiano testified at an earlier COW that schools could manipulate the GT classification to get more WSF funds.
	Mitch Otani	Presented an example of how AP courses are handled currently – at one high school, AP classes are self-referred, while at other schools it is teacher referred. There is no state standard; each school has their own policy.
	Paul Daugherty Cary Miyashiro	Suggested to reduce GT weight to .100 and move the remaining fund that would have been allocated to GT, be moved to ELL to address NEPS and LEPS, but not FEPS.
	Mitch Otani	Asked Committee that if we did that, would your principal actually hire a teacher for ELL?
	Fred Murphy	How would this impact WSF funds for schools? Mililani with a low ELL population would lose .165 weights for GT students. ELL should not hinge on GT.
	Bruce Naguwa	ELL is a critical issue, but GT is also an integral part of the school program. Some parents demand a GT program. This is taking from Peter to pay Paul.
	Jan Iwase	It really depends on your community if they need GT or ELL support.
	Bill Taylor	Motion to have COW X take up the ELL and GT discussion.

	Gail Nakaahiki	Suggested the new OCISS AS look into the Title III allocation.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Title III is a federal grant so the Department has no say when the federal releases the funds. Sometimes it is released so late, school have to scramble to spend it.
	Cary Miyashiro	Suggested only having two categories for ELL – NEP and LEP. Eliminate the FEP category.
	Committee Members	Pass unanimously to defer ELL and GT decision to COW X.
Lunch 11:59 PM – 12:35 PM		
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Adequacy. The COW’s job is to equitably distribute WSF funds to schools not to find adequate funds for the Department.
	Fred Murphy	Mililani High lost money the last time the COW requested additional fund for schools. Funds were distributed by base funding instead of formula.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Requested Mr. Murphy to clarify what he meant Mililani High lost money.
	Fred Murphy	If funds were distributed by formula, Mililani would have received \$180,000, but only receive \$59,000 through base funding. Any additional funds should be distributed by formula. The average dollar per student gap grows between large and small schools when additional funds are distributed by base funding.
	Gail Nakaahiki	Explained that the intent of the additional funds was to provide funds for one data coach at each school. It had to be distributed by base funding. If not small schools would not receive enough funds for one position.
	Bruce Naguwa	Large schools usually have about 30 students per class, but some small schools may have 12-14 students per class.
	Jan Iwase	We need to be more creative with small schools, like sharing principals as some mainland schools. Some small schools could have combo classes.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Informed the committee that she is aware of three small school sharing a SCC position, but when the same schools asked HGEA to share a VP position, the union said no.
	Roxane Martinez	Inquired if VP can be assigned at the district level.
	Mitch Otani	Suggested instead of a district VP, maybe a district academic officer.
	Paul Daugherty	You’ll need about 373 kids to break even if funds were distributed by formula. 90 percent of our elementary are not even that big.
	Chad Okamoto	What is our intent in asking for additional funds this year? We need to be specific.
	Gail Nakaahiki	Suggested COW IX request for additional funds for a vice principal position for each school that the BOE decided not to pursue during COW VIII.

	Fred Murphy	Hawaii's WSF formula is much more sophisticated than Los Angeles and Houston. Large schools will lose out whenever additional funds are distributed through base funding versus formula.
	Mitch Otani	If we ask the legislature for additional funds for a specific purpose, the Department will have a higher chance of getting the funds, instead of asking for a general increase to WSF. At least everyone would have gained. Legislators may get more responses from small school if they received enough funds for a VP position rather than if large schools get most of the funds, and small school get very little to make a difference.
	Bill Taylor	Suggested the Committee request funding this time around for a test coordinator for testing, technology coordinator for the computers needed for testing, or teacher mentor for all the new teachers.
	Fred Murphy	How would you feel if your school gets \$22 per student, while another school gets \$108 per student? That is what is happening with base funding.
	Elton Kinoshita	Suggest gap funding - schools get to choose the gap they need to address.
1:04 PM		Elton Kinoshita departs.
	Brian Hallett	Expressed that when we submit a funding request to the legislature, it will need to be defined in terms of the formula – be it base or per pupil.
	Roxane Martinez	Informed the committee that her school had three data coaches but eliminated a VP position. Maybe we could request for one to one device funding.
	Jan Iwase	We tried that and the Legislature did not fund it.
	Gail Nakaahiki	We need additional funds to go into base funding because small school cannot afford basic functions.
	Bruce Naguwa	A small school does not need a VP, tech coordinator and a data coach for 200 students.
	Paul Daugherty	Suggested the committee request additional funds for ELL.
	Fred Murphy	Asked if increase will be in base funding or formula?
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Targeted funding - increase for ELL students only.
	Roxane Martinez	Inquired how much funds would be needed to make ELL weight equal with GT.
	Mitch Otani	About \$7 million.
	Suzanne Mulcahy	When the funds come down to the school level, it would be up to the principal how to spend it.
	Paul Daugherty	Motion to request Legislature to add \$10 million to WSF to support ELL population to close the achievement gap. Bill Taylor second. Pass unanimously.
	Fred Murphy	Motion to request Legislature to increase WSF by 2% to keep up with the consumer price index. Gail Nakaahiki second. Pass unanimously,

	Suzanne Mulcahy	Reviewed the draft recommendation and will be adding today's decisions. Informed the committee that recommendation will be presented to the FIC on August 18. Asked Committee if they should meet on August 7?
	Jan Iwase	Motion that the Committee does not need to meet on August 7. Fred Murphy second. Pass unanimously
	Suzanne Mulcahy	Thanked the committee members for their service and invited them to the BOE FIC meeting on August 18 if they are available.
Adjourned at 1:40PM.		