

**Department of Education
Queen Liliuokalani Building
Committee on Weights
Meeting 3
March 10, 2017**

Members: Present: Mitchell Otani (Chair), Chad “Keoni” Farias (Vice Chair), Justin Hughey, Jan Iwase, Elton Kinoshita, Roxane Martinez, Wendy Matsuzaki, Glen Miyasato, Cary Miyashiro, Bruce Naguwa, Gail Nakaahiki, Ann Paulino, Bill Taylor

Excused: Daniel Hamada and Osa Tui

Guest Speakers: Anna Viggiano, Extended Learning Specialist
Debbie Farmer, Director, Student Support
Richard Seder, Research Specialist

Staff: Kimberly Chee, Lizbeth Guadiz-Franco, Brian Hallett, Ken Kuraya, Gary Zane

| Topic | Speaker | Discussion |
|--|----------------|--|
| Opening – 9:07 AM | Mitchell Otani | Greetings and welcome. Reviewed the day’s agenda. Any unfinished business can be continued at next meeting. |
| Public Testimony | | None submitted |
| Approval of Minutes February 23, 2017 Meeting 2 Minutes | | Members reviewed minutes. Cary Miyashiro move to approve minutes. Bruce Naguwa second. Approved unanimously with revisions. |
| Office of Human Resources Presentation and Discussion | Barbara Krieg | Presented about DOE initiatives to improve teacher retention and recruitment. Data is for all types of BU5 employees, not just teachers in the classrooms. Visit DOE’s, “ <i>School Data & Reports</i> ” site for more detailed information. Tracking Teacher Retention effective August 1. Currently, almost 96% of teacher positions are filled. At the start of the SY, 93% teacher positions were filled. Informed about tracking of licensed teachers. A third of new hires have teaching experience. New hires do not necessarily mean inexperienced teachers. It means they are new to the DOE. The filled teacher positions are now in the matrix of the strategic plan. OHR is specifically calling out SPED teachers because of the critical need there. These numbers do not indicate teachers who completed their SATEP because they are given three years after hire to obtain their license. If not, OHR will separate them from teaching service. In SPED there is a higher number of vacancies with a |

| | | |
|--|-----------------|---|
| | | <p>higher number of teachers who have not completed the SATEP.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Most recent track is 2012 ➤ Obtained nationwide tracks from Council of Great Schools site. ➤ Teacher mobility data only pertains to teachers in the Hawaii DOE |
| | Justin Hughey | Request to see salaries compared to school districts with similar cost of living and data from teacher separation questionnaires if they're leaving due to salary. Stated that Hawaii's high cost of living may be affecting recruitment and retention. Suggested that teacher salary should be addressed because of the high cost of living. |
| | Barbara Krieg | We do have a " <i>Reason For Leaving</i> " questionnaire on the Separation Form and one selection is, "Dissatisfied With Salary". |
| | Ann Paulino | As a principal of a Hawaiian Language Immersion School, she is experiencing a difficult time recruiting teachers and needs to find creative ways of filling vacancies. Inquired if Office of Hawaiian Education (OHE) tracks vacancies at Hawaiian Immersion Schools? |
| | Barbara Krieg | The reason we don't see data on Hawaiian Language teachers is because we don't have data by teacher types and subjects area. OHR are aware of the severe shortages of Hawaiian Immersion teachers and is working with the OHE, HTSB and the Superintendent Office on ways to address the problem. OHR has granted exception to the Hawaiian Immersion Programs on fill vacancies in certain hard to fill areas and substitutes filling vacancies. |
| | Ann Paulino | Feels that OHR and PRO need constant reminders about hiring for the Hawaiian Immersion Schools. Receiving all kinds of applicants who don't meet our requirements. |
| | Barbara Krieg | Will follow up with the PRO. |
| | Justin Hughey | Inquired what was the projected vacancy for next school year (SY)? There was a projected 1600 teacher vacancies for this SY. |
| | Barbara Krieg | That number was a response to a reporter's question but it's inaccurate. OHR won't know until the end of the SY. Separation Form choices can be: pregnancy, leaving the state, retirement, care of elderly parents, salary dissatisfaction, etc. Separations can also because of move to admin or work away from the classrooms. |
| | Justin Hughey | Does your separation questionnaire have a sub category selection about leaving because of Salary? |
| | Wendy Matsuzaki | Checked the form and yes it does have a sub category. |

| | | |
|--|----------------|--|
| | Justin Hughey | Stated that he worked two jobs when he first came to Hawaii and that we must address the issue of teacher's salary. |
| | Barbara Krieg | Salary is not within OHR responsibility. It falls on negotiations. There is Title II federal fund dedicated to support teachers for professional development. National Board Certified teachers receives \$5,000 and hard to staff area teacher recruits also receive \$5,000. Reimbursement comes from OHR funds. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Inquired if there are any data that OHR have on vacancies that were recruited and filled by mainland applicants and stayed? |
| | Barbara Krieg | About 70% of applicants are from Hawaii addresses but there's no other way to know if they actually live here. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Teachers should be more realistic on salary and costs when they come to teach from out of state. |
| | Barbara Krieg | OHR is revising info. It's hard to capture data on if they'll stay. We need to find ways to improve teacher retention. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Kauai received funding from the legislature for teacher retention. |
| | Barbara Krieg | We choose to recruit from the areas where the points of interests are. It doesn't matter whether East or West Coast. Also, the Department no longer pays for recruiting teachers from out of state. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Shared that four teachers left because their families were on the East Coast. It's not always a matter of salary. |
| | Jan Iwase | Are there educational opportunities for teachers or to attract possible teachers? |
| | Barbara Krieg | Distance education. |
| | Jan Iwase | Express those teachers whose education is from distance learning are not prepared to teach. |
| | Barbara Krieg | OHR is promoting local residents to enter the teaching profession. Designated hard to staff areas are given a generous loan program and additional incentive for SPED teachers. Possible stipend for tuition costs at UH. |
| | Jan Iwase | Likes AS Krieg's ideas, but problem is teachers are overworked and spending a lot of time in meetings. |
| | Barbara Krieg | UH is working on dual certified teachers. All UH students must take a certain number of ELL courses. |
| | Justin Hughey | Stated that teachers are telling new teachers this is not a good field. Teachers don't feel respected. Not a lot of takers on \$10,000 to come back because: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Not advertised 2. Not being allowed to teach, for some reason. 3. Teachers were denied |
| | Barbara Krieg | The example you're referring to was denied because |

COW X 3/10/17 Meeting Minutes

| | | |
|-------------------------------|-----------------|--|
| | | applicant did not have SPED teaching experience before coming to the DOE. |
| | Roxane Martinez | Are there incentives for teachers to make more money? |
| | Barbara Krieg | Yes, continuing education to move up in class. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Shared that he sends out educational opportunities to his teachers, but a lot choose not to take advantage. |
| | Justin Hughey | Expressed he could not take advantage of these opportunities because he had to work part time. He recommends step movements. |
| | Brian Hallett | Asked what statements do the committee want to make about HR? Flexibility in position descriptions? |
| | Ken Kuraya | Inquired about which programs the committee think are viable to be added to WSF? |
| | Jan Iwase | Asked AS Krieg what sort of shortages do we have? |
| | Barbara Krieg | Highest percentage of vacancies are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tractor Operator • School Psychologists • Occupational Therapists • Data Process Analysts • Educational Assistants • Speech Pathologists |
| | Glen Miyasato | From OHR perspective, any recommendations? |
| | Barbara Krieg | No recommendations. |
| | Justin Hughey | Shared he sees burnout with Occupational Therapists and Psychologists. |
| | Barbara Krieg | OHR does advertise. The newspaper is the most effective tool but also use social media. OHR has no separate budget for advertising. |
| | Jan Iwase | There's a higher vacancy rate in temporary positions. Recommend mentoring beginning teachers. |
| | Barbara Krieg | PDERI has a small staff. Some schools have mentors in their budgets. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Farrington/Kalani CA was involved in a project to provide mentoring to new teachers. |
| | Barbara Krieg | The Superintendent has approved two SPED mentors to help programs in schools. |
| | Chad Farias | Shared that schools have been able to come up with providing mentors and compensate them. Recommend creative ways to compensate teachers. |
| | Ann Paulino | It's hard to fill vacancies in her rural area. The unlicensed teachers need to be working towards getting their SATEP and mentors would help in reaching that goal. |
| Break 10:38 – 11:09 AM | | |
| Adequacy Presentation | Richard Seder | Presented on school funding adequacy. |

| | | |
|--|-----------------------------|--|
| <p>& Discussion School Funding Adequacy</p> | | <p>Overview:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Equity – question of fairness <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Horizontal equity ○ Vertical equity (i.e. Hawaii’s COW) • Adequacy – question of sufficiency • Estimating Adequacy – a standard methods • Understanding Adequacy – more are than science • Adequacy in action – some experiences in other states like Massachusetts and Maryland <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Most adequacy studies are done as part of litigation • Conducting an adequacy study – what’s involved <p>Findings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced size classrooms actually produced harm to students. • Use of aides in classrooms doesn’t produce a much different outcome. |
| | Justin Hughey | Inquired if there was an adequacy study comparing to other countries? Any conclusions on better outcomes based on smaller class size, paid college tuition? |
| | Richard Seder | Stated that doing a case study on Hawaii would be overly simplistic, but think human resource is a critical function. Finland, South Korea, and Singapore accept the top 10 percent of high school graduates into their teacher’s training programs. Teachers in those countries are not paid well, but it’s the prestige of the profession they seek. Finland has a high expectancy for students to succeed but give greater autonomy to teachers to design their own programs. South Korea has a more regimented system. The question is, which one do you want? Biggest factor of these countries are the skills and competency of the teachers. How do we attract the best? |
| | Mitchell Otani | Shared that in 2005, there was an adequacy study that state funding should increase by \$278 million. Have we reached the level of funding that we had prior to the cuts in 2010 or are we still chasing that money? |
| | Senior AS & CFO Amy Kunz | Using 2008 as a baseline, we’re not keeping up with the consumer price index increase for general funds. |
| | Richard Seder | Expressed that he felt the Grant Thornton’s Adequacy Study in 2005 was not very well done. |
| | Mitchell Otani | In the course of time from 2005 to 2008 and present, are we flat in terms of dollars coming from the legislature? |
| | Amy Kunz | K-12 had a significant increase in high needs students (reduced lunch, ELL) not just SPED students in 2008. |

| | | |
|--|----------------|--|
| | Richard Seder | It's not a question of the final number, but how did you get to those numbers that was studied. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Inquired if collective bargaining increases were allocated? |
| | Amy Kunz | Confirmed FY 16, 17, 18 and 19 budgets are based on current contracts in place. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Observed that from FY 2008 to 2015, budget seems flat? If we were not adequately funded in 2008, we are not adequately funded in 2015. |
| | Justin Hughey | Suggest we look at per pupil spending compared to other regions or districts with the similar cost of living. Asked Mr. Seder for recommendation |
| | Richard Seder | That's what everybody's asking. There is no "the number". |
| | Justin Hughey | Stated that maybe it's not adequacy. Maybe it's comparative. Are we funding our schools as well as the private schools here, where 40% of the community takes their kids? And what is the differential? Maybe adequacy is too far reaching or too depressing. |
| | Bruce Naguwa | Task is how to fund various sub groups, it's not asking for more funds. How do we propose to look at the different categories of students or weights to help define where money should be appropriated? |
| | Richard Seder | Great question. Unfortunately, we don't have great answers. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inputs and outputs, we don't have understanding • Achieved without dollars, success can be measured • Solutions without work around adaptation • What's working in schools and why is it working? How can we better understand this variation that's taking place? |
| | Jan Iwase | Asked what Maryland and Massachusetts is doing differently that is getting them better results? Schools are in session less hours. |
| | Richard Seder | We don't see a strong systematic relationship between dollars and outcome. Collaborative time, done outside of school time: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Look at collaborative time without constraints • Test it out to see if it works and is of value • Did giving up, for example, art, recess, etc., make a difference? Don't know. Make sure you're learning something from what you experience. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Increased substitute costs because of teachers going to PD and reduced instruction time. Suggest paying teachers stipends to keep teachers in classrooms more. |

| | | |
|------------------------------------|-----------------|--|
| | | Hopefully it will improve test scores. |
| | Richard Seder | How can we be sure what we're getting and doing is making a difference? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No research capabilities within the DOE • We need to learn • We need to have evaluations systems • We do a terrible job of learning • Our PD is not effective as long as we don't change because we will be doing what we do We need to be more creative |
| | Mitchell Otani | Former Supt. Hamamoto wanted 11 month teachers where all PD would be 1 month during the Summer. There would be no release from classes. |
| | Richard Seder | So you're asking me to give you a simple answer to a complex question? We need to learn what is happening in each classroom and schools. We need evaluations that are process oriented. We need to look at the successes and copy them. We need to compare other areas and learn from the good and bad. Richard visited a school in Connecticut, |
| Lunch Break 12:15 – 1:15 | | |
| Learning Centers Discussion | Anna Viggiano | Presented on learning centers. Each learning centers have different criteria but should be open to all student. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Not looking to place learning centers into the weights. Looking at ways to increase outreach to schools that don't have learning centers. |
| | Anna Viggiano | Communication needs to be more systemic so we can get the word out. Sometimes, it's hard for students to get to the learning centers. |
| | Cary Miyashiro | Inquired if student need to get a GE to attend a learning center? |
| | Anna Viggiano | No because it's not for the whole day. |
| Deaf and Blind Discussion | Debbie Farmer | Hawaii School for the Deaf and Blind (HSDB) is a school within the Honolulu District. Boarding is available for middle and high school students. Express that there needs to be a school for students to have social interaction with student with similar disabilities, as opposed to isolating students at home school. HSDB staff all use American Sign Language. Half of the staff is deaf also. Specialized services come at a high cost. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Inquired if there are sites in every district for the hearing impaired? For example, Aikahi and Windward District? |
| | Debbie Farmer | Provided example that it can be draining on resources to send a child to a special school, but if no one else in the home is impaired, who will student relate to? The child will be isolated. |
| | Roxane Martinez | Shared Waimalu Elementary has special services. |

| | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| | Ann Paulino | Asked if special schools are carefully monitored. Inquired when do students attend special schools? Pre-K to Age 22. Suggest home schools keep them until upper elementary or middle school. Feels young children should go home and see their families every day. |
| Budget Updates | Brian Hallett | COR meeting is this Monday (March 13, 2017). House will release details next week Tuesday (March 20, 2017). According to the press release, soft economic projections are causing concerns. \$500 million has been reduced from the Governor's original request. What is currently in the budget still: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Hawaii Keiki made it in the budget (\$5.6 Mil for two years), 2. Office of Hawaiian Education, 3. Pre-K Programs expansion, 4. Homeless (1 liaison for every CA plus a few extras for Leeward & Honolulu), 5. Position counts for pre-school teachers, 6. SPED teachers and EA's. \$10 million for WSF deleted. Most on this list was not in the Governor's budget, except for Pre-K. |
| Weighted Formula Review & Discussion | Mitchell Otani | Inquired if members had any suggestion to add new categorical program or weighting factors to WSF? Looking at SY 2018-19. Criteria: What would benefit most, & not impact unfairly another, at this time. |
| | Justin Hughey | \$54 Million for utilities - asked if there's any solar projects that's supposed to get off the ground anytime soon. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Op Terra is currently installing 800+ panels at Kalani, but school will not realize any cost savings. Also, principals don't want to be stuck to pay electricity bill when the price of oil goes up. Mr. Hallett shared that when DOE realize cost savings, the legislature reduced our budget in kind. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Requested a WSF calculation scenario to increase base funding by one vice principal. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Inquired what positions the base funding of \$259,000 include? |
| | Kimberly Chee | Not certain, but believe it includes a principal, SASA, custodian, and a teacher for the elementary levels. For secondary school levels, she thinks it includes a registrar and counselor. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Asked if there was an adjustment to base funding due to this year's increase average salary cost? |
| | Kimberly Chee | One year there was an adjustment because salaries increased, but none since. The committee could recommendation an adjustment every 2 years based on the average salary cost. |

| | | |
|--|----------------|--|
| | Bruce Naguwa | As far as base funding for small elementary schools, if ES continues then there will be a workload issue. If it discontinues, small elementary schools do not need a VP. If ES discontinues and the Department goes back to observation, as an example, cannot see small elementary schools getting additional base funding. The funds should go to ELL and other programs. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Confirmed one scenario will be base funding adjusted for current average cost. |
| | Kimberly Chee | Explained how current ELL calculation is done. Exactly \$13.8 million is distributed for ELL students. The weights for each of these categories are going to change every single year depending on current statewide counts. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Suggest changing ELL to reflect an additional \$10 million in the ELL pot and establishing a weighting factor for each level moving forward, not tied to a set ELL pot. |
| | Cary Miyashiro | Request running a scenario for a VP for every level. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Suggested an alternative scenario by providing salary for half a VP. Reminded committee that AS Chun discussed challenges with educating the homeless. Asked if the committee add a weighting factor for homeless, what would it be? There are about 3,000 homeless students. |
| | Ken Kuraya | Shared homeless concentration is a little heavier in Leeward Coast. But there are groups even in Mitchell's areas. Suggest a .10 factor - like for the economically disadvantaged, .20, or .05. Currently there's a homeless Title I or ESSA funding for about \$349 plus dollars per student. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Asked how many millions for 3,000 kids with a .10 factor? |
| | Kimberly Chee | Right now counts are 2800 homeless kids, so it's about \$1.2 million. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Roughly, that would translate into a reduction of about \$6 per student in the weight of 1. |
| | Kimberly Chee | Shared a quick calculation that if we increase ELL by \$10 million without additional funds, the effect on the weight of 1 is about \$51 per student. Will provide a school by school at the next meeting. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Asked that scenario be calculated in isolation, do not combine requested scenarios. |
| | Gary Zane | Presented on the WSF Reserve funding. Last year, there were over \$5 million dollars of requests for \$2,250,000. WSF Reserve fund was at \$3 million about 2-3 years ago, then it was reduced to \$225,000 so that \$750,000 could shift to assist combination school based funding. There's an application process the schools have to go through. The applications are sent to the CAS', and the CAS' |

COW X 3/10/17 Meeting Minutes

| | | |
|---|-----------------|--|
| | | decide which schools in their district they feel needs additional help, based on the four criteria. A committee of CASes will review the applications and recommend to the Superintendent on which schools will receive the WSF Reserve Funds and how much. |
| | Bill Taylor | Inquired if Maui's canoe district 7 remote school always receive WSF Reserve fund? |
| | Elton Kinoshita | Recalled the past COW voted to increase base funding for combo schools, there was discussion if they could continue to apply for the WSF Reserve funds. There are added costs like postage, since we don't have courier, and just to ship supplies is so expensive |
| | Roxane Martinez | Request to see what schools applying due to extraordinary circumstances are using money for? |
| | Elton Kinoshita | Provided an example of Waiahole school. It's a small school with about 80 students, the question is, should we keep a school this size open? Every year there is talk closing this school, but the community comes out to support keeping it open, The principal has a combo grade because there in not enough funds to have 1 teacher for every grade level. So, in this case, the WSF Reserve funding has been the vehicle for a school to cover the basics. . |
| | Jan Iwase | I know the year that we asked for and got money, we had lost considerable enrollment for 2 years in a row. We had gone from a thousand kids to 800. The first year we covered it, the second year, we couldn't. Military, we didn't know when they'd leave. So talking about that school, Waiahole, I think we need to start looking at different models for schools, and I don't see anything wrong with multi age. I visited a school that was multi-age. They say that the kids always have to have a new teacher, but that's a hard transition for the students. Don't we want to get to know the students better? In multi- age schools, they do things so well. I think we need to start looking at looping and multi-age. |
| | Wendy Matsuzaki | Express concerns about ripple effect of feeder schools going to intermediate. |
| | Mitchell Otani | Next meeting is on Friday, March 31, 2017. |
| | Gail Nakaahiki | Request minutes be available for review earlier. |
| Meeting Adjourned at 2:50 PM | | |