

## LEGISLATIVE REPORT

**SUBJECT:** Relating to the State Budget

**REFERENCE:** Act 164, SLH 2011 (HB 200, HD1, SD1, CD1, Section 131)

**ACTION REQUESTED:** No funds for FY2012-13 shall be expended for home-to-school transportation costs not mandated by state or federal law, provided the DOE report on comprehensive analysis of alternatives for providing student transportation, cost-benefit analysis of each alternative, prioritized transportation routes, examination of fee schedules and pricing strategies, evaluation of other jurisdiction programs, and recommendations including actual costs of all services.

**DOE REPORT:** The attached report and summary provides the requested information.

**Introduction:**

**FINDINGS:** See attached.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:** None.

## **DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION'S REPORT TO THE 2012 HAWAII STATE LEGISLATURE**

Pursuant to Section 131 of Act 164 of the 2011 Regular Session

*This report is organized in the order that Items (1) through (7) are listed in Section 131 of Act 164/2011. The proviso language is in bold face. The DOE's report is presented in normal text.*

**Section 131. Provided that of the general fund appropriation for the department of education (department), excluding charter schools, no funds for fiscal year 2012-2013 shall be expended for home-to-school transportation costs not mandated by state or federal law; provided further that the department shall prepare a report that shall include:**

**(1) A comprehensive analysis of alternatives for providing student transportation, including but not limited to the elimination of transportation services not mandated by law, route consolidation and reduction scenarios, methods of reducing contracted costs, implementation of transportation services with state personnel and/or buses, partnerships with county agencies, and the use of tripper services.**

- Elimination of transportation services not mandated by law - The complete elimination of school transportation services not mandated by law would effectively end public school bussing services for general education students except for those affected by the Federal No Child Left Behind Act (i.e. students who transfer from under-achieving schools) and the McKinney-Vento Act (i.e. students who are homeless).
- Route consolidations - The department already uses "route consolidations" as a cost-cutting tool. The department will continue to seek further route consolidation opportunities.
- Route reduction scenarios – Other than by route consolidation, reducing the overall number of bus routes can be accomplished by reducing the overall number of "qualified" student passengers or by discontinuing service. Reducing the number of qualified student passengers would require stiffer qualification criteria, but such an action would place hardships on families who rely on the public school bus service. Discontinuing service would mean eliminating certain routes in specific geographic locations based on criteria that would include but not be limited to the availability of public transportation, the percentage of students qualified for free or reduced price lunch, the compactness of the student population, and the topography of surrounding roads and sidewalks.
- Methods of reducing contracted costs - Bus contracting costs are driven by the prevailing market place. Robust competitive bidding among service providers – or the lack thereof – substantially influences the market place's response to bus contract solicitations. The department is committed to expanding its pool of potential service providers by inviting participation from non-school bus operators as well as mainland-based companies.

The department continues to explore short-term and long-term alternatives for reducing contracted costs, such as:

- Allowing contractors to park buses on school campuses,
- Extending the usable life of school bus vehicles,
- Reducing the number of standby vehicles contractors must provide,
- Revising price adjustment provisions (i.e. fuel, wage and CPI cost adjustments),
- Repealing the wage certificate requirement,

- Clarifying the department's responsibility to contractors if it exercises its right to terminate the contracts with 30 days notice,
- Allowing contractors to determine the routes, bus sizes, and number of buses,
- Increasing the number of buses per bid package,
- Increasing the contract term,
- Providing buses to contractors, and
- Providing baseyards to contractors.

These measures can be incorporated into future contracts, but existing contracts require amendment through negotiation. The wage certificate is statutory; repealing it would require legislation.

Cost saving measures that do not require amending contract agreements include:

- Staggering school hours in order to maximize usage of hired vehicles.
- Coordinating school waiver days to reduce the overall number of operating days.
- Eliminating free bus service (fare-free ridership) in order to reduce ridership while increasing bus fare revenue.
- Combining age groups (elementary, middle, high) on the same bus.
- Instituting 4-day school weeks while increasing school hours from 6 hours per day to 7.5 hours per day. This action would reduce the overall number of service days by 20% without compromising student instructional hours.
- Increasing the school bus fare in order to increase bus fare revenue and reduce the demand for bus transportation.
- Increasing the distance from school that students must live to qualify for bus service.
- Consolidating all school bus operations into a single contract

Implementing some of these measures would require either legislation or amendments to Chapter 8-27 ("Transportation of Students"), Hawaii Administrative Rules.

- Implementation of transportation services with state personnel and/or buses - Since 2005, the department has operated a limited number of general education buses in Kailua-Kona utilizing state personnel on state-leased school bus vehicles. The department has since determined that private contractors can furnish public school bussing services at no greater expense and with fewer challenges than the department can with public employees.
- Partnerships with county agencies using tripper services – School trippers are extra services provided by municipal bus operators to protect against overcrowding on municipal bus routes serving schools. There are federal regulations (49 CFR Part 605) directed at protecting the private sector against unfair competition and ensuring that federal funding for municipal services is focused on providing services that meet the needs of the "general public". School tripper services may be operated if they meet the following criteria:
  - There is sufficient demand to warrant the operation of a tripper;
  - There are sufficient resources to operate a tripper;
  - The school tripper will not result in significant increase in travel time for regular customers; and

- The school tripper is operated as part of the regularly scheduled public transportation service.

The City and County of Honolulu has provided tripper service to certain schools for many years. The City transportation officials have resisted shifting significant numbers of students from school bus to City bus service because their resources are incapable of absorbing the increased ridership.

**(2) A cost benefit analysis of each alternative identified (above);**

- Elimination of transportation services not mandated by law – This would save \$40 million or more annually, subject however to the costs associated with cancelling existing contracts. The cost of cancelling existing contracts would need to be negotiated, but should not exceed \$20 million. A determination of the cost to parents and the community for terminating public school transportation services not mandated by law requires subjective assumptions that include the net increase in the cost to parents for getting their children to and from school, the increase in casualties when students shift to other modes of transportation, the cost of increased absenteeism and school drop outs, and the increased community carbon footprint.
- Route consolidations – The savings from route consolidations already implemented is \$605,000 in FY 2012. Additional route consolidations would increase cost savings.
- Route reduction scenarios – The savings from reducing bus routes would be dependent upon the number of routes that are eliminated. The current average price of a general education school bus is approximately \$400 per day. Each reduced bus requires a “fixed cost” payment to the contractor of \$100 per day through the end of the contract period. Therefore, the immediate realized cost savings for each reduced bus is approximately \$300 per day.

The savings from reducing routes in parcels by eliminating certain routes in specific geographic locations is as follows:

- Eliminating HIGH SCHOOL bus service on Oahu Island – Approximately \$6.12 million per year before the one-time termination cost that should not exceed \$3 million.
- Eliminating HIGH SCHOOL and MIDDLE SCHOOL bus service on Oahu Island – Approximately \$13.18 million per year before the one-time termination cost that should not exceed \$6.6 million.
- Eliminating ALL bus service on Oahu Island except for all schools in designated “Zones of School Innovation” (ZSI) – Approximately \$14.6 million per year before the one-time termination cost that should not exceed \$7.3 million.
- Methods of reducing contracted costs – The savings from contractors voluntarily reducing their existing contract prices is indeterminate. The department remains optimistic that it may be able to reduce some its transportation costs through negotiations.

Cost saving measures that do not require amending contract agreements include:

1. Staggering school hours – Staggered school hours enables the ability to assign vehicles to multiple trips at multiple campuses, thereby reducing the overall number of required vehicles. However, the savings from using staggered school hours is indeterminate because school participation and the spacing of school hours will influence its effectiveness. The department is discussing formulating a mandate on staggered school hours in areas where savings could be achieved.
2. Coordinating school waiver days – The department has already made significant progress in this area, and there are no school waiver days that affect students in the current school year. The cost savings of fully coordinated school waiver days is estimated to be less than 1% annually.
3. Eliminating free bus service (fare-free ridership) – The net savings (made up of increased revenue and lower costs because fewer buses would be required) of eliminating free bus service could reach \$14 million annually, assuming half the free riders choose to continue riding the bus once they have to pay, and before considering the one-time cost of reducing the number of buses, which is estimated not to exceed \$4 million. If only 25% of the free riders choose to continue riding the bus once they have to pay, the savings could reach \$18 million annually before considering the one-time cost of reducing the number of buses, which is estimated not to exceed \$6 million.
4. Combining age groups on the same bus – The department has already made significant progress in this area. However, more opportunities remain. The cost savings will be minimal.
5. Instituting 4-day school weeks – The savings from this option could be significant. The direct benefit to transportation costs is a savings of 20%, or about \$8 million before considering a 20% reduction in bus pass revenue due to the reduction in the number of service days, which is estimated to be about \$0.6 million. Closing school campuses on what would otherwise be normal school days could result in additional cost savings to the DOE. This change has ramifications beyond student transportation and would require legislation to implement.
6. Increasing the school bus fare – The current school bus fare is equivalent to the current youth fare on City & County of Honolulu buses, and the department does not believe it is equitable to charge school bus riders more than the equivalent “youth” fare on City & County of Honolulu buses.
7. Increasing the distance from school that students must live to qualify for bus service – Increasing the qualifying distance from 1 mile to 1.5 miles for students in grades K-5 and from 1.5 to 2 miles for students in grades 6-12 would decrease both revenue and ridership, with a net reduction in costs estimated at \$4 million.
8. Consolidating all bus operations into a single contract – More than one party has expressed interest in bidding for such a contract with indications that potentially significant savings to the department may be achievable.

- Implementation of transportation services with state personnel and/or buses – The department has determined that in-sourcing student transportation services is not beneficial to the state.
- Partnerships with County agencies and use of tripper services – The savings from discontinuing certain school bus routes on Oahu is estimated at \$714,000 for FY 2012.

**(3) A prioritized listing of student transportation routes, the reason the route is a priority, the projected number of students serviced, and the projected cost of providing transportation service for the route;**

This report includes Appendixes A through F (see attachments) which lists the following data:

- A. Current regular education contracts by district on Oahu Island
- B. Current regular education contracts by district on Neighbor Islands
- C. Current special education contracts by district on Oahu Island
- D. Current special education contracts by district on Neighbor Islands
- E. Current cost savings from route consolidations (idling buses)
- F. The number of contracts and buses that are scheduled to expire in each of the next 6 years

The following table is a prioritized listing of student transportation routes that the department intends to target for continuance in case of insufficient funding:

Priority Complex	Students Reason for Priority	Projected Number of Students Serviced	Estimated Annual Cost of Non-Mandated Services
1. Ka'u-Keaau-Pahoa	ZSI; High Poverty (93% ride free)	2,940	\$ 3.07 million (37 buses)
2. Nanakuli-Waianae	ZSI; High Poverty (87% ride free)	1,821	\$ 1.67 million (23 buses)
3. Hana	High Poverty (85% ride free)	198	\$ 405,000 (5 buses)
4. Molokai Island	High Poverty (78% ride free)	852	\$ 1.19 million (21 buses)
5. Hilo-Laupahoehoe-Waiakea	High Poverty (75% ride free)	1,422	\$ 1.42 million (17 buses)
6. Lahaina	High Poverty (67% ride free)	454	\$ 842,400 (13 buses)
7. Castle-Kahuku	High Poverty (63% ride free)	1,340	\$ 2.08 million (30 buses)

*\* Cost estimates are based on current contract prices for each region, and are based on 180 school days per year*

**(4) An examination of fee schedules and evaluation of projected cost of providing transportation service for various pricing strategies**

The recent history of bus fares is shown in the table below:

Bus Pass Type	Through 12/31/2009	1/1/10 to 6/30/11	Current
One-way Bus Coupons	\$ 0.35	\$ 0.75	\$ 1.25
Quarterly Round Trip	\$ 31.50	\$ 60.00	\$ 72.00
Annual Round Trip	\$ 119.70	\$ 225.00	\$ 270.00

The total student bus fare collections for SY 2009-2010 were \$ **2,075,000**.  
 (The total cost of general education bus contracts for SY 2009-2010 was \$35,762,000)

The total student bus fare collections for SY 2010-2011 were \$ **2,651,000**.  
 (The total cost of general education bus contracts for SY 2010-2011 was \$39,417,000)

The total student bus fare collections for SY 2011-2012 are \$ **1,921,000** (to date)  
 (Student bus fare collections for SY 2011-2012 are projected to reach \$ 2,568,000 by year's end  
 The total cost of general education bus contracts for SY 2011-2012 is projected to be \$41,484,000)

Currently, a student is eligible for free bus service if he/she qualifies for one of the following criteria, as provided in Chapter 8-27, HAR:

- Receives free meal
- Is a foster child
- Is directed by the DOE to attend a school other than the child's home school
- Has 3 or more older siblings who pay for their bus pass
- Is homeless
- Has transferred from his/her neighborhood school that was "In Status" to a school "Not In Status". "In Status" is a No Child Left Behind (NCLB) designation for schools that have not made adequate yearly progress for two or more consecutive years.

In school year 2009-2010, there were **18,111** registered free bus riders  
 (This represents an estimated \$2,244,000 in lost student bus fare revenue for 2009-2010)

In school year 2010-2011, there were **19,999** registered free bus riders  
 (This represents an estimated \$4,500,000 in lost student bus fare revenue for 2010-2011)

So far in school year 2011-2012, there are **20,514** registered free bus riders  
 (This represents an estimated \$5,539,000 in lost student bus fare revenue for 2011-2012)

The cost of providing student transportation service using "various" pricing strategies is heavily dependent on the overall number of paying riders in each student fare price point. The table below illustrates FOUR of an infinite number of pricing scenarios:

<b>Subject:</b>	<b>Now</b>	<b>No. 1</b>	<b>No. 2</b>	<b>No. 3</b>	<b>No. 4</b>
Annual fare	\$270	\$270	\$270	\$540	\$540
Some riders ride free?	Yes	No	No	Yes	No
% of free riders who ride if they must pay	NA	50%	25%	NA	10%
% of fare-paying riders who continue riding	NA	100%	100%	40%	40%
Number of paying riders	16,000	26,000	21,000	6,400	8,400
Number of fare-free riders	20,000	None	None	20,000	None
Total number of bus riders	36,000	26,000	21,000	6,400	8,400
Total cost (millions)	\$40	\$29	\$23	\$29	\$ 9
Cost per rider	\$1,100	\$1,100	\$1,100	\$1,100	\$1,100
Total Revenue (millions)	\$ 4	\$ 7	\$ 6	\$ 3	\$ 5
Net Cost (millions)	\$36	\$22	\$17	\$26	\$4

*NOTE: Assumes expenses can be reduced proportionately to ridership reduction. In reality, this will result in unacceptably poor service.*

**(5) An evaluation of how student transportation is administered, and how costs are managed and paid for, in other jurisdictions;**

For this exercise, the department selected one urban jurisdiction from each of the four continental United States time zones for best comparison purposes. They are:

Jurisdiction	Transportation Administered By	Costs Are Paid For By	Services Furnished By Contractor and District
Washington State	Pupil Transportation in Washington State is a section within the Office of the Superintendent of Public Instruction (OSPI). The Superintendent of Public Instruction is one of nine statewide elected officials. The Director of Pupil Transportation is under the Assistant Superintendent for Student Support and Operations.	Legislative appropriation provides funding for five regional transportation coordinators. The coordinators assist school districts in preparing funding reports, provide local program review for school district operations, and participate in all aspects of statewide pupil transportation programs. The District does NOT charge students a fare.	District
Indiana State	The Director of the Office of School Transportation is under the Indiana Department of Education.	All school bus transportation operations and school bus purchases are funded on an individual school district basis completely through local property taxes. The District does NOT charge students a fare.	District
Louisiana State	The Director of the Division of Student and School Learning Support, School Bus Transportation Program	Revenue is generated by each district. City school board provides free transportation for any student attending a school of suitable grade and approved by the State Board of Elementary and Secondary Education. The District does NOT charge students a fare.	District
Maryland	The Pupil Transportation Director is under the Division of Business Services of the Maryland DOE	The State Comptroller shall pay from the General State School Fund the annual appropriation for Student Transportation. The District does NOT charge a student fare.	District

**(6) Recommendations on the options identified in the report;**

- Elimination of services not mandated by law – This option would render immediate and significant cost relief of \$40 million or more. However, such an action would place a substantial burden on families who currently utilize public school bussing services as their only means of getting their children to and from school, and has other undesirable consequences (see discussion on Page 1 under this same heading). Therefore, the department does not recommend this as a cost-saving measure.
- Route consolidations – The department is committed to seeking additional route consolidation opportunities in order to further reduce school bus transportation costs.
- Route reduction scenarios – Although the department is not in favor of reducing general education bussing services to any degree since it would place undue hardship on students who depend on public school bus services, we agree that it is probably the only “effective” way of immediately and significantly reducing transportation costs. To that end, the department recommends that eliminating bus service in parcels, beginning with Oahu riders because of the availability of city bussing services, would be the best approach.
- Reducing contracted costs – The department is committed to continuing its pursuit of reducing the cost of existing contract agreements through one-on-one negotiations. The department’s recommendations on cost-saving measures that do not require negotiation are as follows:
  1. Staggering school hours – The department is in favor of staggering school hours as a means of reducing its transportation costs and is exploring scheduling options in complexes where such a change would reduce school bus costs.
  2. Coordinating school waiver days – The department is discussing a mandate of this to reduce its transportation costs.
  3. Eliminating free bus service – Most school bus riders qualify for free bus service, which effectively increases ridership while simultaneously reduces bus pass revenue. Eliminating free bus service will increase bus revenue and reduce ridership at the same time (assuming that many free riders would find alternative methods of transportation rather than pay for a bus pass). Whether certain students should receive free bus service or not is a policy decision; the department does not recommend eliminating free bus service at this time for the reasons stated above.
  4. Combining age groups on the same bus – Although the cost benefit of combining age groups on the same bus would be minimal, the department will implement this as part of a comprehensive cost cutting plan.
  5. Deploying 4-day school weeks – Despite the fact that the cost benefit of 4-day school weeks could be significant (up to 20% annually), the department does not recommend it as a viable option, as it believes that such a proposal would meet with stiff public resistance. It would also require an amendment to the state statute that mandates 180 days of instruction.

6. Increasing the student bus fare – The department has already raised the student bus fare by 350% in two years, yet student bus fare continues to account for only about 7% of the overall cost of general education school bussing services. As discussed above, the department believes the school bus fare should approximate the Honolulu City Bus youth fare, which is now the case. The table on page 6 above calculates the financial impact of various fare scenarios.
7. Consolidating all bus operations into a single contract - Several potential bidders have suggested that consolidating all student transportation services into a single contract could achieve significant savings for the department, and that they would be interested in bidding for such a contract. Such a program, however, if adopted, would likely have to be implemented over a period of five or six years to enable existing contracts to expire. The Department continues to explore this concept.
- Implementation of transportation services with state personnel and/or buses – The department does not recommend furnishing services with state personnel as a viable cost-reducing alternative. However, the department will explore the concept of furnishing state-leased buses to private contractors (similar to the model that the City and County of Honolulu uses to provide its public transit services) because such an action may reduce the overall cost of leasing and financing school bus vehicles.
  - Partnership with county agencies and use of tripper services – The department will explore this option with county tripper agencies.

**(7) Identification of the actual costs for all student transportation services for the prior two fiscal years and projected costs for the current fiscal year by means of financing, contract, and route; and identification of those costs for services that are mandated by law**

<u>Expenditures</u>	<u>FY 2010*</u>	<u>FY 2011</u>	<u>FY 2012**</u>
General education transportation	\$58,155,000	\$77,297,000	\$74,142,000
Cost of DOE-furnished Bus Operations in Kona	773,000	580,000	216,000
City bus passes	315,000	326,000	357,000
Parent mileage reimbursements	65,000	58,000	59,000
Administrative costs	770,000	711,000	706,000
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$60,078,000</b>	<b>\$78,972,000</b>	<b>\$75,480,000</b>

\* SY 2010 included only 162 school days of service due to teacher furloughs.

\*\* FY 2012 costs are estimates.

Approximately \$29 million, \$32 million, and \$33 million of these costs are for services that are mandated by law in FY 2010, FY 2011, and FY 2012, respectively.

<u>Means of Financing</u>	<u>FY 2010</u>	<u>FY 2011</u>	<u>FY 2012</u>
General funds	\$17,005,000	\$67,405,000	\$ 72,380,000
Federal impact aid	39,874,000	7,507,000	
Department of Defense		2,155,000	1,529,000
Federal homeless assistance	243,000	100,000	100,000
Special fund (bus fare)	801,000	2,431,000	3,000,000
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$60,078,000</b>	<b>\$78,972,000</b>	<b>\$75,480,000</b>

The costs by contract are included in the attached appendices.

**Provided further that the department shall submit the report to the legislature no later than forty days prior to the convening of the 2012 regular session; and provided further that the legislature may appropriate funds for student transportation services not mandated by state or federal law upon receipt and evaluation of the report.**

**2011-12 SCHOOL BUS CONTRACTS BY DISTRICT**  
**Regular Education - Oahu Island**

	<b>Contract Number</b>	<b>Company</b>	<b>District</b>	<b>Start Date</b>	<b>End Date</b>	<b>No. of Buses</b>	<b>Daily Miles</b>	<b>Contract Cost Per Day</b>	<b>Cost Per Bus Per Day</b>
1	60136	Ground	Central	7/1/06	6/30/14	10	145	\$ 3,250.61	\$ 325.061
2	60137	Ground	Central	7/1/06	6/30/14	7	83	\$ 2,276.35	\$ 325.192
3	60176	Yamaguchi	Central	7/1/06	6/30/14	27	605	\$ 10,347.06	\$ 383.225
4	70232	Ground	Central	7/1/07	6/30/13	21	682	\$ 5,583.22	\$ 265.868
5	70233	Ground	Central	7/1/07	6/30/13	6	188	\$ 1,595.37	\$ 265.895
6	70234	Gomes	Central	7/1/07	6/30/13	15	210	\$ 4,566.82	\$ 304.455
7	80137	Robert's	Central	7/1/08	6/30/14	16	396	\$ 8,497.95	\$ 531.122
8	80138	Robert's	Central	7/1/08	6/30/14	4	106	\$ 2,124.17	\$ 531.041
9	90130	Tomasa	Central	7/1/09	6/30/19	5	90	\$ 1,960.97	\$ 392.195
						111		\$ 40,202.52	

1	60135	Ground	Honolulu	7/1/06	6/30/14	1	41	\$ 364.38	\$ 364.378
2	10182	Robert's	Honolulu	7/1/11	6/30/15	1	22	\$ 325.00	\$ 325.000
3	10088	Ground	Honolulu	7/1/10	6/30/14	4	232	\$ 1,639.31	\$ 409.828
						6		\$ 2,328.69	

1	70235	Ground	Leeward	7/1/07	6/30/13	7	136	\$ 2,177.37	\$ 311.053
2	80134	Robert's	Leeward	7/1/08	6/30/14	14	559	\$ 7,425.87	\$ 530.419
3	80135	Robert's	Leeward	7/1/08	6/30/14	17	1024	\$ 9,001.15	\$ 529.480
4	80136	Robert's	Leeward	7/1/08	6/30/14	16	435	\$ 8,496.14	\$ 531.008
5	90131	Tomasa	Leeward	7/1/09	6/30/19	15	916	\$ 5,313.20	\$ 354.214
6	90132	Tomasa	Leeward	7/1/09	6/30/19	8	386	\$ 2,836.22	\$ 354.527
						77		\$ 35,249.95	

1	70236	Gomes	Windward	7/1/07	6/30/13	6	132	\$ 1,978.95	\$ 329.825
2	70237	Gomes	Windward	7/1/07	6/30/13	14	264	\$ 4,518.90	\$ 322.778
3	80111	Gomes	Windward	7/1/08	6/30/14	10	226	\$ 3,548.97	\$ 354.897
4	80139	Robert's	Windward	7/1/08	6/30/14	13	446	\$ 6,908.47	\$ 531.421
						43		\$ 16,955.29	

Cumulative Cost of REGED Bus Contracts on Oahu PER DAY: \$ 94,736.45

Gross Cost of REGED Bus Contracts on Oahu (180 school days): \$ 17,052,561.02

**2011-2012 SCHOOL BUS CONTRACTS BY DISTRICT**  
**Regular Education - Neighbor Islands**

Contract Number	Company	District	Start Date	End Date	No. of Buses	Daily Miles	2011-2012 Cost Per Day	Cost Per Bus Per Day
1 60174	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/06	6/30/12	2	95	\$ 718.10	\$ 359.051
2 10183	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/11	6/30/17	8	342	\$ 3,710.00	\$ 463.750
3 70238	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	162	\$ 1,224.16	\$ 408.053
4 80112	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	6	342	\$ 2,454.37	\$ 409.062
5 80123	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	3	96	\$ 1,106.42	\$ 368.807
6 80140	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	20	1353	\$ 10,565.21	\$ 528.261
7 90114	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	5	192	\$ 1,973.96	\$ 394.792
8 90115	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	4	234	\$ 1,577.20	\$ 394.300
9 90120	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	2	51	\$ 1,192.50	\$ 596.249
10 90121	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	1	22	\$ 427.00	\$ 427.004
11 90122	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	2	48	\$ 853.91	\$ 426.954
12 90123	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	4	167	\$ 2,383.39	\$ 595.848
13 90124	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	3	127	\$ 1,787.50	\$ 595.833
14 90125	Robert's	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	6	270	\$ 3,574.60	\$ 595.767
					69		\$ 33,548.33	

1 02024	Robert's	West Hawaii	7/14/06	6/30/12	12	250	\$ 5,635.34	\$ 469.612
2 80113	Yamaguchi	West Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	14	581	\$ 7,152.89	\$ 510.921
3 80125	Robert's	West Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	6	180	\$ 3,189.14	\$ 531.523
4 90126	Robert's	West Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	16	859	\$ 9,528.85	\$ 595.553
5 90127	Robert's	West Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	2	60	\$ 1,192.28	\$ 596.140
6 90128	Robert's	West Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	2	139	\$ 1,190.33	\$ 595.166
					52		\$ 27,888.84	

1 50066	Yamaguchi	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	1	42	\$ 329.83	\$ 329.830
2 50068	Yamaguchi	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	2	116	\$ 652.82	\$ 326.411
3 50070	Yamaguchi	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	2	35	\$ 621.20	\$ 310.602
4 50070	Yamaguchi	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	1	18	\$ 311.69	\$ 311.689
5 50071	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	10	306	\$ 3,280.56	\$ 328.056
6 50071	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	3	127	\$ 987.93	\$ 329.310
7 50072	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	1	50	\$ 327.66	\$ 327.662
8 50073	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	13	554	\$ 4,328.94	\$ 332.996
9 50073	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	1	20	\$ 336.20	\$ 336.196
10 10185	Robert's	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/17	19	unavailable	\$ 8,850.00	\$ 465.789
11 70032	Akita	Kauai	7/1/07	6/30/13	1	128	\$ 490.44	\$ 490.442
12 70239	Yamaguchi	Kauai	7/1/07	6/30/13	1	74	\$ 411.69	\$ 411.685
					55		\$ 20,928.96	

1 50059	Dudoit	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/13	6	210	\$ 1,936.27	\$ 322.712
2 50059	Dudoit	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/13	1	27	\$ 326.04	\$ 326.042
3 50065	Akita	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/13	3	64	\$ 1,012.23	\$ 337.412
4 60175	Akita	Maui	7/1/06	6/30/14	5	185	\$ 2,246.87	\$ 449.374
5 10184	Robert's	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/17	43	unavailable	\$ 19,365.00	\$ 450.349
6 10186	Spencer	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/17	7	unavailable	\$ 2,100.00	\$ 300.000
7 70240	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	2	40	\$ 597.35	\$ 298.674
8 70241	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	75	\$ 1,130.33	\$ 376.776
9 70242	Akina	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	62	\$ 1,028.79	\$ 342.929
10 70243	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	6	214	\$ 1,986.23	\$ 331.038
11 70244	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	8	327	\$ 2,465.46	\$ 308.183
12 70245	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	5	96	\$ 1,527.34	\$ 305.468
13 70246	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	112	\$ 1,208.06	\$ 402.686
14 70247	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	112	\$ 1,208.06	\$ 402.686
15 70248	Robert's	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	2	58	\$ 658.68	\$ 329.342
16 70249	Molokai Trans	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	4	104	\$ 1,331.84	\$ 332.959
17 10081	Akina	Maui	7/1/10	6/30/20	3	169	\$ 1,362.61	\$ 454.202
					107		\$ 41,491.15	

Cumulative Cost of REGED Bus Contracts on Neighbor Islands PER DAY: \$ 123,857.29

Gross Cost of REGED Bus Contracts on Neighbor Islands (180 school days): \$ 22,294,311.74

**2011-2012 SCHOOL BUS CONTRACTS BY DISTRICT  
Special Education (Curb-to-Curb only) - Oahu Island**

	<b>Contract Number</b>	<b>Company</b>	<b>District</b>	<b>Start Date</b>	<b>End Date</b>	<b>No. of Buses</b>	<b>Daily Miles</b>	<b>2011-2012 Cost Per Day</b>	<b>Cost Per Bus Per Day</b>
1	60140	RHSB	Central	7/1/06	6/30/12	26	895	\$ 8,894.09	\$ 342.081
2	70325	RHSB	Central	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	148	\$ 1,690.56	\$ 563.520
3	70326	Yamaguchi	Central	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	128	\$ 1,638.89	\$ 546.296
4	80114	RHSB	Central	7/1/08	6/30/14	3	254	\$ 1,840.31	\$ 613.438
5	90118	Ground	Central	7/1/09	6/30/19	20	1257	\$ 9,913.07	\$ 495.654
						55		\$ 23,976.93	

1	60138	RHSB	Honolulu	7/1/06	6/30/12	19	857	\$ 5,810.25	\$ 305.802
2	60138AC	RHSB	Honolulu	7/1/06	6/30/12	2	90	\$ 730.01	\$ 365.005
3	60139	RHSB	Honolulu	7/1/06	6/30/12	20	1276	\$ 6,326.15	\$ 316.308
						41		\$ 12,866.41	

1	70327	RHSB	Leeward	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	250	\$ 1,778.20	\$ 592.734
2	70328	Ground	Leeward	7/1/07	6/30/13	22	823	\$ 10,243.66	\$ 465.621
3	80126	Tomasa	Leeward	7/1/08	6/30/14	9	517	\$ 3,195.95	\$ 355.106
4	90119	Ground	Leeward	7/1/09	6/30/19	31	1319	\$ 15,530.69	\$ 500.990
						65		\$ 30,748.51	

1	70329	Tomasa	Windward	7/1/07	6/30/13	2	110	\$ 912.70	\$ 456.351
2	70330	Gomes	Windward	7/1/07	6/30/13	13	411	\$ 5,159.54	\$ 396.888
3	70331	Gomes	Windward	7/1/07	6/30/13	12	447	\$ 4,759.22	\$ 396.602
4	80115	Tomasa	Windward	7/1/08	6/30/14	6	134	\$ 2,190.01	\$ 365.002
						33		\$ 13,021.48	

Cumulative Cost of SPED Bus Contracts on Oahu PER DAY: \$ 80,613.32

Gross Cost of SPED Bus Contracts on Oahu (210 school days): **\$ 16,928,797.75**

2011-2012 SCHOOL BUS CONTRACTS BY DISTRICT  
Special Education (Curb-to-Curb only) - Neighbor Islands

	Contract Number	Company	District	Start Date	End Date	No. of Buses	Daily Miles	2011-2012 Cost Per Day	Cost Per Bus Per Day
1	70332	RHSB	East Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	8	312	\$ 4,434.71	\$ 554.339
2	70333	RHSB	East Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	8	312	\$ 4,565.94	\$ 570.742
3	70334	RHSB	East Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	9	351	\$ 4,989.06	\$ 554.340
4	70335	RHSB	East Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	1	39	\$ 554.34	\$ 554.343
5	90116	Akita	East Hawaii	7/1/09	6/30/19	3	313	\$ 1,435.43	\$ 478.476
						29		\$ 15,979.48	

1	02027	RHSB	West Hawaii	7/14/06	6/30/12	4	121	\$ 1,934.84	\$ 483.709
2	60134	Akita	West Hawaii	7/1/06	6/30/12	2	188	\$ 783.10	\$ 391.552
3	70336	RHSB	West Hawaii	7/1/07	6/30/13	6	360	\$ 3,319.56	\$ 553.260
4	80124	Akita	West Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	1	40	\$ 560.87	\$ 560.868
5	80141	RHSB	West Hawaii	7/1/08	6/30/14	4	120	\$ 2,465.21	\$ 616.301
						17		\$ 9,063.58	

1	50077	Akita	Kauai	7/1/11	6/30/13	4	122	\$ 1,674.80	\$ 418.701
2	90117	Akita	Kauai	7/1/09	6/30/19	9	816	\$ 3,107.82	\$ 345.313
						13		\$ 4,782.62	

1	10181	RHSB	Maui	7/1/11	6/30/17	18	unavailable	\$ 7,542.00	\$ 419.000
2	70337	RHSB	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	4	55	\$ 2,132.78	\$ 533.194
3	70338	RHSB	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	6	168	\$ 3,329.39	\$ 554.898
4	70339	RHSB	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	5	133	\$ 2,887.01	\$ 577.402
5	70340	Spencer	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	3	202	\$ 1,103.37	\$ 367.789
6	70341	Dudoit	Maui	7/1/07	6/30/13	2	44	\$ 749.56	\$ 374.782
7	80116	Akita	Maui	7/1/08	6/30/14	1	4	\$ 410.65	\$ 410.646
8	90129	RHSB	Maui	7/1/09	6/30/19	6	200	\$ 3,537.38	\$ 589.564
						45		\$ 21,692.13	

Cumulative Cost of SPED Bus Contracts on Neighbor Islands PER DAY: \$ 51,517.81

Gross Cost of SPED Bus Contracts on Oahu (210 school days): \$ 10,818,740.03

2011-2012 COST SAVINGS DUE TO ROUTE CONSOLIDATIONS

Contract	Company	District	Start	End	No. of Idled Buses	Cost Per Bus Per Day	Total Idle Cost Per Day	2011-12 Price Per Bus/Day	Gross Savings Per Bus/Day	Gross Savings Per Day
1 90130	Tomasa	Central	2/22/2010	6/30/2019	2	\$ 100.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 392.19	\$ 292.19	\$ 584.39
					2					\$ 584.39

1 70235	Ground	Leeward	2/22/2010	6/30/2013	3	\$ 100.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 311.05	\$ 211.05	\$ 633.16
2 80134	RHSB	Leeward	2/22/2010	6/30/2014	2	\$ 100.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 530.42	\$ 430.42	\$ 860.84
3 80136	RHSB	Leeward	8/1/2011	6/30/2014	4	\$ 100.00	\$ 400.00	\$ 531.01	\$ 431.01	\$ 1,724.03
4 90132	Tomasa	Leeward	2/22/2010	6/30/2019	1	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 354.53	\$ 254.53	\$ 254.53
					10					\$ 3,472.56

1 60135	Ground	Windward	7/1/2007	6/30/2012	2	\$ 100.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 364.38	\$ 264.38	\$ 528.76
2 70236	Gomes	Windward	7/1/2010	6/30/2013	1	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 329.82	\$ 229.82	\$ 229.82
3 70237	Gomes	Windward	7/1/2009	6/30/2013	2	\$ 100.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 322.78	\$ 222.78	\$ 445.56
4 80139	RHSB	Windward	8/2/2010	6/30/2014	1	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 531.42	\$ 431.42	\$ 431.42
					6					\$ 1,635.56

1 80140	RHSB	East Hawaii	8/2/2010	6/30/2014	2	\$ 100.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 528.26	\$ 428.26	\$ 856.52
2 90121	RHSB	East Hawaii	8/2/2010	6/0/2015	1	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 427.00	\$ 327.00	\$ 327.00
					3					\$ 1,183.53

Cumulative Cost Savings Per Day for SY 2011-2012: \$ 6,876.03

Gross Annual Cost Savings for SY 2011-2012: \$ 1,237,685.47

**CUMULATIVE NUMBER OF CONTRACTS AND BUSES EXPIRING BY DATE**  
Regular Education and Special Education

	District	Expires On	No. of Buses	2011-2012 Cost Per Bus/Day	Contract Type
1	Central Oahu	6/30/12	26	\$ 342.081	SPED
2	East Hawaii	6/30/12	2	\$ 359.051	REGED
3	Honolulu	6/30/12	19	\$ 305.802	SPED
4	Honolulu	6/30/12	2	\$ 365.005	SPED
5	Honolulu	6/30/12	20	\$ 316.308	SPED
6	West Hawaii	6/30/12	12	\$ 469.612	REGED
7	West Hawaii	6/30/12	4	\$ 483.709	SPED
8	West Hawaii	6/30/12	2	\$ 391.552	SPED
			87		

1	Central Oahu	6/30/13	21	\$ 265.868	REGED
2	Central Oahu	6/30/13	6	\$ 265.895	REGED
3	Central Oahu	6/30/13	15	\$ 304.455	REGED
4	Central Oahu	6/30/13	3	\$ 563.520	SPED
5	Central Oahu	6/30/13	3	\$ 546.296	SPED
6	East Hawaii	6/30/13	3	\$ 408.053	REGED
7	East Hawaii	6/30/13	8	\$ 554.339	SPED
8	East Hawaii	6/30/13	8	\$ 570.742	SPED
9	East Hawaii	6/30/13	9	\$ 554.340	SPED
10	East Hawaii	6/30/13	1	\$ 554.343	SPED
11	Kauai	6/30/13	1	\$ 329.830	REGED
12	Kauai	6/30/13	2	\$ 326.411	REGED
13	Kauai	6/30/13	2	\$ 310.602	REGED
14	Kauai	6/30/13	10	\$ 328.056	REGED
15	Kauai	6/30/13	1	\$ 327.662	REGED
16	Kauai	6/30/13	13	\$ 332.996	REGED
17	Kauai	6/30/13	1	\$ 490.442	REGED
18	Kauai	6/30/13	1	\$ 411.685	REGED
19	Kauai	6/30/13	4	\$ 418.701	SPED
20	Leeward Oahu	6/30/13	7	\$ 311.053	REGED
21	Leeward Oahu	6/30/13	3	\$ 592.734	SPED
22	Leeward Oahu	6/30/13	22	\$ 465.621	SPED
23	Maui	6/30/13	6	\$ 322.712	REGED
24	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 337.412	REGED
25	Maui	6/30/13	2	\$ 298.674	REGED
26	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 376.776	REGED
27	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 342.929	REGED
28	Maui	6/30/13	6	\$ 331.038	REGED
29	Maui	6/30/13	8	\$ 308.183	REGED
30	Maui	6/30/13	5	\$ 305.468	REGED
31	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 402.686	REGED
32	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 402.686	REGED
33	Maui	6/30/13	2	\$ 329.342	REGED
34	Maui	6/30/13	4	\$ 332.959	REGED
35	Maui	6/30/13	4	\$ 533.194	SPED
36	Maui	6/30/13	6	\$ 554.898	SPED
37	Maui	6/30/13	5	\$ 577.402	SPED
38	Maui	6/30/13	3	\$ 367.789	SPED
39	Maui	6/30/13	2	\$ 374.782	SPED
40	West Hawaii	6/30/13	6	\$ 553.260	SPED
41	Windward Oahu	6/30/13	6	\$ 329.825	REGED
42	Windward Oahu	6/30/13	14	\$ 322.778	REGED
43	Windward Oahu	6/30/13	2	\$ 456.351	SPED
44	Windward Oahu	6/30/13	13	\$ 396.888	SPED
45	Windward Oahu	6/30/13	12	\$ 396.602	SPED
			265		

	District	Expires On	No. of Buses	2011-2012 Cost Per Bus/Day	Contract Type
1	Central Oahu	6/30/14	10	\$ 325.061	REGED
2	Central Oahu	6/30/14	7	\$ 325.192	REGED
3	Central Oahu	6/30/14	27	\$ 383.225	REGED
4	Central Oahu	6/30/14	16	\$ 531.122	REGED
5	Central Oahu	6/30/14	4	\$ 531.041	REGED
6	Central Oahu	6/30/14	3	\$ 613.438	SPED
7	East Hawaii	6/30/14	6	\$ 409.062	REGED
8	East Hawaii	6/30/14	3	\$ 368.807	REGED
9	East Hawaii	6/30/14	20	\$ 528.261	REGED
10	Honolulu	6/30/14	1	\$ 364.378	REGED
11	Honolulu	6/30/14	4	\$ 409.828	REGED
12	Leeward Oahu	6/30/14	14	\$ 530.419	REGED
13	Leeward Oahu	6/30/14	17	\$ 529.480	REGED
14	Leeward Oahu	6/30/14	16	\$ 531.008	REGED
15	Leeward Oahu	6/30/14	9	\$ 355.106	SPED
16	Maui	6/30/14	5	\$ 449.374	REGED
17	Maui	6/30/14	1	\$ 410.646	SPED
18	West Hawaii	6/30/14	14	\$ 510.921	REGED
19	West Hawaii	6/30/14	6	\$ 531.523	REGED
20	West Hawaii	6/30/14	1	\$ 560.868	SPED
21	West Hawaii	6/30/14	4	\$ 616.301	SPED
22	Windward Oahu	6/30/14	10	\$ 354.897	REGED
23	Windward Oahu	6/30/14	13	\$ 531.421	REGED
24	Windward Oahu	6/30/14	6	\$ 365.002	SPED
			217		

1	Honolulu	6/30/15	1	\$ 325.000	REGED
			1		

0		6/30/16	0		
			0		

1	East Hawaii	6/30/17	8	\$ 463.750	REGED
2	Kauai	6/30/17	19	\$ 465.789	REGED
3	Maui	6/30/17	43	\$ 450.349	REGED
4	Maui	6/30/17	7	\$ 300.000	REGED
5	Maui	6/30/17	18	\$ 419.000	SPED
			95		